

***Evaluation and Appraisal Report***  
***of***  
***the Sanibel Plan***  
**2012**

**City of Sanibel  
Lee County, Florida**

\*\*\*\*\*  
*This Report was prepared by the Sanibel Planning Commission and submitted to  
the City Council by PC Resolution no. 12-14, adopted on August 28, 2012.*

*Following additional review and further revisions, the Report was adopted by the  
City Council (Resolution no. 12-097), on November 6, 2012.*





## *LIST OF CITY OFFICIALS*

### City Council

Kevin Ruane, Mayor  
Mick Denham, Vice Mayor  
Doug Congress  
Marty Harrity  
Jim Jennings

### Planning Commission

Michael Valiquette, Chair  
Phillip Marks, Vice Chair  
Chris Heidrick  
Chuck Ketteman  
Tom Krekel  
Holly Smith  
John Talmage

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

• List of City Officials .....	3
• Table of Contents .....	4
• Purpose.....	4
• Preparation of the Report .....	5
• <b>Executive Summary</b> .....	<b>6</b>
• Evaluation and Appraisal of the <i>Sanibel Plan</i> ,.....	11
• Action for Evaluation and Appraisal Report-Based Amendments .....	11
• Identification of Proposed Updates, Clarifications and Amendments to the text (including Goals, Objectives and Policies) of the <i>Sanibel Plan</i> .....	<b>Exhibit A</b>
• Identification of Amendments to the Official Maps of the <i>Sanibel Plan</i> .....	<b>Exhibit B</b>

## PURPOSE

The purpose of this Evaluation and Appraisal Report (EAR) of the *Sanibel Plan* is to assess the Plan's effectiveness in managing growth and redevelopment and in responding to change.

The preparation and adoption of an Evaluation and Appraisal Report is directed by State law (*Florida Statutes, Section 163.3191*). This Evaluation and Appraisal Report has been prepared to meet that requirement. **This Report has also been prepared to provide the basis and the content for the EAR-based Amendment to the *Sanibel Plan*.**

This Report also accomplishes the following important purposes:

- review of past actions taken to implement the *Sanibel Plan*
- assessment of the effectiveness of the objectives of the *Sanibel Plan*

- identification of areas in the *Sanibel Plan* that should be updated
  - in response to changing conditions and trends affecting the City of Sanibel
  - in response to changes in State requirements regarding growth management and development
  - in response to new data and analysis
- ensuring effective intergovernmental coordination

This Report includes updates for the data and analysis that provides the minimum review criteria for the preparation of the *Sanibel Plan*. The Background Discussion for each Element of the *Sanibel Plan* has been updated as indicated in **Exhibit A** of this Report.

The Report also updates the timeframe for the *Sanibel Plan*:

- the initial (5 year) planning period is through the year 2017; and
- the long-range (10 year) planning period is through the year 2022.

**The principal purpose of this Evaluation and Appraisal Report is to convey the City Council’s commitment to update the *Sanibel Plan*; to address changes in State Law and Rule; and to amend the *Sanibel Plan*, where appropriate, consistent with the adopted Evaluation and Appraisal Report.**

## **PREPARATION OF THE REPORT**

This Evaluation and Appraisal Report has been prepared in conformity with public participation procedures, pursuant to *Florida Statutes, Section 163.3181*. Throughout the process of preparing this Report, public comments have been requested, appreciated and considered.

The schedule of Planning Commission hearings on the preparation of the Evaluation and Appraisal of the *Sanibel Plan* is provided in PC Resolution no. 12-10, which presented the draft report to the City Council.

The Draft 2012 Evaluation and Appraisal Report (EAR) was prepared by the Sanibel Planning Commission, the local planning agency, pursuant to *Florida Statutes, Section 163.3191*. By Planning Commission Resolution no. 12-10, the

Draft 2012 Evaluation and Appraisal Report of the *Sanibel Plan* was transmitted by the Planning Commission to the City Council on August 28, 2012.

The Evaluation and Appraisal Report prepared by the Planning Commission [has been](#) reviewed and adopted by City Council at public hearings. The 2012 Evaluation and Appraisal Report of the *Sanibel Plan*, adopted on [November 6](#), 2012 is to be transmitted to the Florida Department of Economic Opportunity, to the other reviewing State agencies, as part of the 2012 Evaluation and Appraisal Report-Based Amendment to the *Sanibel Plan*, pursuant to *Florida Statutes, Section 163.3184*.

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This Report presents the 2012 Evaluation and Appraisal of the *Sanibel Plan*. It has been seven years since the 2005 Evaluation and Appraisal of the *Sanibel Plan*.

**Of foremost importance is that the findings of this Report conclude that the *Sanibel Plan* is consistent with State requirements, including changes to State Statutes contained in the “Community Planning Act”. In fact, the *Sanibel Plan* is consistent with State requirements even without any Plan Amendments based on this Evaluation and Appraisal of the *Sanibel Plan*.**

This Evaluation and Appraisal Report reaffirms many objectives and policies of the *Sanibel Plan*. The Plan Amendments recommended by this Evaluation and Appraisal of the *Sanibel Plan* update the Plan and reflect changes in local conditions.

The major recommendations of this Evaluation and Appraisal Report address the following topics:

- Study of the Carrying Capacity of the Beaches

- Capital Improvements

- Housing

- Official Maps

- Policy Revisions and Additions or Revisions to Programs

## Study of the Carrying Capacity of the Beaches

The preservation of Sanibel's natural resources has always been a basic tenet of the *Sanibel Plan*. The objective to preserve the natural beach has been expressed more directly in subsequent updates of the *Sanibel Plan*.

Sanibel's uniqueness requires preserving its natural beaches - beaches where humans co-exist with wildlife. The City has taken many steps and implemented a number of programs to protect the natural systems on Sanibel beaches. A brief listing of these programs is provided here:

- Limitations on density (Gulf and Bay Beach Zones are Preservation Districts)

- Limitations on the amount of coverage with impermeable surfaces

- Limitations on removal of native vegetation

- Limitations on the amount of developed area

The Plan for Coastal Zone Protection, contains many provisions which protect the Carrying Capacity of the Beach, such as

  - Restoring the dune system, improving pedestrian accessways, regulating beach paraphernalia, prohibiting live shelling, protecting of seagrasses, restricting vehicles on the beach to patrols and emergency vehicles, prohibiting raking and scraping of naturally occurring beach wrack, restricting beach lighting, prohibition on point source discharges for wastewater effluent into coastal waters, avoidance of new point source discharges from stormwater runoff into coastal waters and prohibition on seawalls, bulkheads and other shoreline structures along the coastline

Other programs that limit development and human activity to a level of use that can be accommodated and continued without irreversible impairment of the beach's natural resource productivity, such as

  - Prohibition on the excavation in the Gulf Beach Ridge

  - Prohibition on exploitation of natural resources

  - Conditional use restrictions on commercial activities in the Resort Housing District

  - Special Event restrictions and limits on activities taking place on the beach

  - A limited and controlled beach parking program

This Evaluation and Appraisal Report recommends amending a policy that requires a study of the carrying capacity of the beach for use by wildlife. The

amendment to that policy will retain the option to conduct a beach carrying capacity study. This change allows the City to assess the budgetary implications of undertaking the study and the likely benefits that would result from the study. [The timing and extent of the study can be established when budgetary constraints allow.](#)

However, the City should broaden the monitoring of its beaches to better establish baseline conditions. An annual report should be prepared based on the monitoring data. The City should look for ways to cost-effectively include measurements of human activities on the beach, as part of its monitoring of the beaches. [The City should also undertake a review of carrying capacity study methods and identify likely benefits that can be derived from a study to ensure that Sanibel's beaches remain viable for use by wildlife.](#)

The existing policies of the *Sanibel Plan* that contribute to maintaining the carrying capacity of the beach for use by wildlife are reaffirmed by this Report.

### **Capital Improvements (Level of Service Standards for Public Facilities)**

The City retains its concurrency management system to ensure that public facilities are available concurrent with development; although it is important to note that the City has essentially reached “build-out”. The City has arrived at a redevelopment phase. The provision of human support systems (public facilities) will focus on the maintenance and upgrades of existing public facilities.

The Evaluation and Appraisal Report does recommend amending the level of service (LOS) standards for:

Solid Waste Disposal Facilities to be consistent with the LOS standard in the County's Lee Plan (which provides the Solid Waste Disposal Facilities used by the City)

Playgrounds to be consistent with revisions to the Master Parks and Recreation Plan

There are no capital improvement projects needed to attain or maintain the adopted level of service standards for concurrency related public facilities. Therefore, there are no capital improvement needs (required to attain or maintain adopted level of service standards for public facilities) projected for the initial and long range timeframes of this Report, that is through the year 2022. It has been and continues to be financially feasible to achieve and maintain the adopted level of service standards for public facilities.

The City of Sanibel will continue to fund capital improvement projects before deficiencies in level of service for public facilities arise. The City is capable of

funding the capital improvements identified on the Five-Year Schedule of Capital Improvements in Section 3.5.2 Implementation, Monitoring and Evaluation of the *Sanibel Plan* and the City's Five-Year Capital Improvements Program.

The Evaluation and Appraisal Report does recommend removing the policy that sets a capital indebtedness ratio from the *Sanibel Plan*. A policy setting a capital indebtedness ratio can be established for the City apart from the Plan.

## **Housing**

The City is located in the one of the regions of the country that has been most significantly affected by the economic downturn in the housing market. Housing values peaked in 2006 and have subsequently declined. Even during the economic downturn, most existing housing has been well maintained. Private sector activities are currently effective in conserving and maintaining the existing housing stock.

Currently there are 88 BMRH units, representing about 2.6 percent of Sanibel resident households. The 2004 / 2005 Evaluation and Appraisal Report suggests a program target for BMRH units of 3 percent of Sanibel's residential households. Based on changing conditions in the housing market and constraints cited throughout this Plan, Community Housing and Resources will perform a needs assessment and feasibility study including a reevaluation of the program suggested target. In addition, CHR will provide a recommendation to the City for any update in support of establishing a new program target that is both attainable and sustainable.

Economic conditions play a significant role in the demand for Below Market Rate Housing. Since the last Evaluation and Appraisal Report of the *Sanibel Plan*, CHR has increased its BMRH stock by 24 additional units, from 64 to 88. Consequently, this significant increase in housing stock requires a clearer focus on the maintenance of these existing units.

This change in focus towards maintenance does not preclude the future development of additional BMRH units.

## Official Maps

### Future Land Use Map

The following Amendments are proposed to components of the Future Land Use Map:

Replace the **Commercial District Map** with the Commercial Zoning Map (in the Land Development Code)

The **Commercial Zoning Map** of the Land Development Code designates the commercial lands on the Commercial District Map by commercial zoning district: the General Commercial, the General TownCenter Commercial or the Limited TownCenter Commercial.

Amend the **Commercial Zoning (District) Map**

A small commercially-zoned tract at Sanibel-Captiva Road and Sanibel Bayous Road is being removed from the Commercial District.

Amend the **Wetland Conservation Lands Map**

Twelve parcels, comprising approximately 72.1 acres, are recommended to be added to the Interior Wetlands Conservation District on the Wetlands Conservation Lands Map.

Three parcels, comprising approximately 6.6 acres, are recommended for removal from the Interior Wetlands Conservation District on the Interior Wetlands Conservation Lands Map.

Include (add) the **Environmentally-Sensitive Lands Conservation District Map** to the Future Land Use Map

The **Environmentally-Sensitive Lands Conservation District Map**, part of the Land Development Code, is being added to the Future Land Use Map

### Future Traffic Circulation Map

The Future Traffic Circulation Map is being update to reflect the initial (5-year) and long-range (10-year) planning periods of this Report

## **Policy Revisions and Additions or Revisions to Programs**

The following recommendations for the *Sanibel Plan* have implications for the use of City personnel and resources:

In Section 3.3.3. *Transportation*

During the next (initial -2017) planning period of the *Sanibel Plan*, the City intends to review options that can improve the peak hour, peak season, level of service for major roadways.

The City may develop a position statement addressing the use of private busses.

## **EVALUATION AND APPRAISAL OF THE SANIBEL PLAN**

### **Identification of Proposed Updates, Clarifications and Amendments to the *Sanibel Plan***

Since 1976, both development and preservation activities in the City of Sanibel have been guided by the *Sanibel Plan*. For over 35 years the *Sanibel Plan* has provided stability and certainty to land use decision-making for the City, its residents, its property and business owners, and its visitors.

Since 1976 and since the 2007 EAR-based Amendment to the *Sanibel Plan*, the City has met and complies with the objectives and implementing policies of the *Sanibel Plan*. The City of Sanibel's growth continues to be managed in accordance with the goals, objectives and policies of the *Sanibel Plan*.

As the City reaches "build-out", the majority of land development activities will involve infill development and redevelopment projects. In accordance with the Development Intensity Map of the Future Land Use Map Series of the *Sanibel Plan*, less than 2% of the dwelling units permitted on Sanibel (and located outside of existing developments) have yet to be constructed. Over 90% of lands in the Commercial Zoning Districts are fully developed. Conditions and trends indicate that there will be more in-fill and redevelopment than new development in the City from here on out.

The City of Sanibel intends for this Evaluation and Appraisal Report, including its data and analysis, to provide the framework for updating the *Sanibel Plan*.

**The proposed updates, clarifications and amendments to the *Sanibel Plan* generated by the preparation of this Report are presented in their entirety in Exhibit A of this Report.**

The proposed Amendments to the Official Maps of the *Sanibel Plan* generated by the preparation of this Report are presented in Exhibit B of this Report.

## **ACTION FOR THE EVALUATION AND APPRAISAL REPORT-BASED PLAN AMENDMENT**

The City intends to adopt Amendments to update, clarify and revise the *Sanibel Plan* based on this Evaluation and Appraisal Report. In fact, the submittal of this Evaluation and Appraisal Report to the Department of Economic Opportunity will be included in the City's transmittal of the Evaluation and Appraisal Report-Based Amendment to the *Sanibel Plan* to review agencies.